

CARD Project Evaluation Summary Sheet

Project Number and Title: 033/05VIE - <i>Field evaluation and advanced vegetative mass-propagation technology for scaling up high-value plantations of Pinus caribaea</i>			
Vietnamese Institution(s): Research Centre for Forest Tree Improvement (RCFTI) Forest Science Institute of Vietnam,			
Australian Partner Institution(s): Forest Plantations Queensland (FPQ), Formerly DPI Forestry			
Date Approved: 2005	Date Commenced: Feb.06	Date Completed: April 08	
Project budget (A\$):	Total: 413,812	From: AusAID:	225,000
		Vietnamese institution:	88,500
		Australian institution:	100,312
<p>Project Abstract (from Proposal):</p> <p>The Project seeks to review existing experience with and performance of several tropical conifer species in Vietnam, particularly Caribbean Pine, and to establish further replicated trials of improved genetic material, including pine hybrids. Additionally, the project will provide capacity building for several Vietnamese Forest Research institutions relating to conifer tree improvement and mass propagation, particularly via vegetative cuttings. Capacity building will be via hands on training in both Queensland and Vietnam, development of small scale pilot hedge and containerised nursery infrastructure, and a study tour to Australia involving innovative Vietnamese forest managers / researchers.</p> <p>Finally, the project will build awareness amongst both large and small forest growers including ethnic minorities, through the establishment of collaborative demonstration plantings in priority regions for conifer plantation expansion, supported by appropriate training and promotional information.</p>			
<p>Objectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To identify the most highly productive, well-adapted varieties and hybrids of <i>Pinus caribaea</i>, in comparison to other pine species currently planted, for priority pine planting zones - To provide practical training and support to forest research institutes in Vietnam to enable the development and local adaptation of hedge and containerized nursery systems for the mass propagation of containerized pine cuttings. - To create improved awareness amongst rural poor smallholders (particularly central highland minorities) and industrial forest growers in key pine growing regions, regarding the potential performance of improved varieties of Caribbean pine (including hybrids where appropriate) to supply a range of forest products and services via the establishment of large scale demonstration plantings in collaboration with local land owners / forest growers. 			
Milestones Completed:	Y/N		Y/N
1. CARD Contract Signed	Y	8. Comparative Performance of Tropical Pines in Vietnam	Y
2. 1 st Six-monthly Report	Y	9. Large Scale Demonstration and Community and Individual Farmer Managed Sites	Y
3. 2 nd Six-monthly Report	Y	10. Competency Assessments	Y
4. Genetic Evaluation Trials	Y	11. Project Completion Report	Y
5. Hedge & Containerised Nursery Manual	Y		
6. 3 rd Six-monthly Report	Y		
7. Hedge and Containerised Nurseries	Y		
<p>Reports Produced (Title/Date):</p> <p>MS1: 1st Six-monthly Report (October 2006)</p> <p>MS: 2nd Six-monthly Report (April 2007)</p> <p>MS3: Genetic Evaluation Trials (April 2007)</p> <p>MS 4: Hedge & Containerised Nursery Manual (September 2007)</p> <p>MS 5: 3rd Six-monthly Report (September 2007)</p> <p>MS 6: Hedge and Containerised Nurseries (April 2008)</p> <p>MS 7: Comparative Performance of Tropical Pines in Vietnam (January 2007)</p> <p>MS 8: Large Scale Demonstration and Community and Individual Farmer Managed Sites (May 2008)</p> <p>MS 9: Competency Assessments (June 2008)</p> <p>MS 10: Project Completion Report (September 2008)</p>			

Evaluation Team: 1. <i>Mr. Le Van Tan</i> (Team Leader), Science Technology and Environment Department 2. <i>Mr. Pham Duc Chien</i> , Forest Science Institute of Vietnam 3. <i>Mr. Tran Duy Hung</i> , Forest Research Centre 4. <i>Mr. Nguyen Van Kien</i> , CARD M&E Coordinator		Date of Evaluation: September 2008	Project Completion Evaluation (PCIE)
Evaluation Summary	Score a/	Comments	
Relevance	3.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The project concept of mass propagation is very good and useful for the RCFTI and other research institutions that are concerned about the valuable PHC and hybrid pines, and people who like to grow those species. The project also has high potential value as pine species are still valuable for the 5 million ha program of the country. Not so attractive to local people. 	
Impact	3.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A comprehensive study and improvement of varieties of PCH and hybrid pines has well been implemented. A manual of mass propagation methods for those species is available for interested people. Impact is probably limited to SFEs as smallholders do not seem particularly interested in pines The project has positive impact on the environment as its objectives and outputs are to improve quality and quantity of pine plantation (particularly PCH and hybrid pines) in Vietnam 	
Effectiveness	3.5	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Desired project outputs and objectives were achieved . However, Objective 3 was only partly achieved as smallholders do not pay attention to grow <i>pinus caribaea</i> and <i>pinus hybrids</i> as those species' rotations are so long. Therefore the project failed to recognize the risk and assumption The survival rate of propagated material was low, due to a variety of factors, some of which may have been preventable with greater attention from the local partners. Some of the poor propagation sites have been re-established with some success. 	
Efficiency	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Implementing staffs have all benefited from training courses and study tour that would strength institutional partner (Vietnamese institutions). Nonetheless, once again, the purpose of smallholder development and poverty reduction was not obtained, particularly in poor ethnic minorities. 	
Sustainability	3	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The techniques and skills learned from the project are useful for RCFTI staff. They can use those for their further research and production. Unfortunately, this is less useful for other institution (such as Phu Ninh and Da lat) as local people prefer other species. The demonstration trials in some places are not well tended and protected with relatively death rates of planting material. Forestry Companies are also less interested in planting pines. That is, therefore, leading to containerized nurseries and pilot scale hedge are abandoned in Phu Ninh 	
Average Score	3.3		
Overall Assessment b/: Moderately Satisfactory			

Major Problems Identified: the main problem was that the project team did not recognize the risk that pines are not as attractive as other shorter rotation species, such as acacia, and other high price plants such as rubber.

Lessons Learned:

the project should have recognized the risks and assumptions in introducing the long rotation species as there are other preferred fast growing species such as acacia.

Recommendations:

Institutions involved should pay attention to maintaining plant trials

For mass propagation of PCH and hybrid pines to need more continuing research works, such as: nursery hygiene, establishment and maintenance of pine hedges, collecting and setting cuttings, potting mix formulations and container types and stock-raising including watering, irrigation regime and pest and disease management. A result of these research works is guideline for mass propagation of PCH and hybrid pines

a/ 1 = worst 5 = best

b/ Highly Satisfactory, Satisfactory, Moderately Satisfactory, Un-satisfactory